



**Carolina Howard Felicíssimo**

**An Approach to Operationalize Regulative Norms in  
Multiagent Systems**

**Doctoral Thesis**

Thesis presented in partial fulfillment of the requirements for obtaining a doctoral degree in Computer Science from PUC-Rio.

Advisors: Prof. Carlos José Pereira de Lucena  
Prof. Jean-Pierre Briot

Rio de Janeiro  
2008, August



**Carolina Howard Felicíssimo**

**An Approach to Operationalize Regulative Norms in  
Multiagent Systems**

Thesis presented to the Graduate Program in Computer Science of PUC-Rio in partial fulfillment of the requirements for doctoral degree in Computer Science from PUC-Rio. Approved by the professors listed below.

**Prof. Carlos José Pereira de Lucena**

Advisor

Departamento de Informática – PUC-Rio

**Prof. Jean-Pierre Briot**

Co-advisor

Laboratoire d’Informatique – Paris VI

**Prof<sup>a</sup>. Vera Werneck**

Departamento de Informática – UERJ

**Prof. Evandro de Barros Costa**

Instituto de Computação – UFAL

**Prof<sup>a</sup>. Simone Diniz Junqueira Barbosa**

Departamento de Informática – PUC-Rio

**Prof. Firmo Freire**

Departamento de Informática – PUC-Rio

**Prof. José Eugenio Leal**

Coordenador Setorial do Centro Técnico Científico – PUC-Rio

Rio de Janeiro, August 13, 2008

All rights reserved. No part of this thesis may be reproduced in any form or by any means without prior written permission of the University, the author and the advisor.

### **Carolina Howard Felicíssimo**

Computing Engineer and Master in Computer Science both from the Computer Science Department of PUC-Rio since 2001 and 2004, respectively. Currently, she works in the area of Software Engineering for Multiagent Systems, associated to the Software Engineering Laboratory (LES) from PUC-Rio.

### Cataloging Data

Felicíssimo, Carolina Howard

An approach to operationalize regulative norms in multiagent systems / Carolina Howard Felicíssimo ; adviser: Carlos José Pereira de Lucena; co-adviser Jean-Pierre Briot. - 2008.

170 f. ; 30 cm

Tese (Doutorado em Informática) – Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio de Janeiro, Rio de Janeiro, 2008.

Inclui bibliografia.

1. Informática – Teses. 2. Sistemas multiagentes normativos. 3. Normas. 4. Contextos. 5. Imposição de normas. I. Lucena, Carlos José Pereira de. II. Briot, Jean-Pierre. III. Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio de Janeiro. IV. Título.

To the four most important beings in someone's life:  
Parents, relatives, the significant other and friends.

## Acknowledgements

To God, for all the inspiration received and right decisions taken.

To my family, for the support, care, encouragement and everything else, including my life. In particular, to Pedro and Gloria (my parents), Jacqueline (my sister), Izaléa (my second mother) and Adriano and Joselee (my uncle and aunt).

To my advisors, Professors Carlos José Pereira de Lucena and Jean-Pierre Briot. Without them, this work and the important phase of my internship in the *Laboratoire d'Informatique de Paris VI*, in Paris, would not have been possible.

To my “Brazilian” friends, Karin and her boys, Renata, Ly, Adriana, Lena, Viterbo, Casanova, Firmo, Raul, Pádua, Bruno, Dulce, Valéria, Nice and to the LES team (specially to Lyrene, Miriam, Gustavo, Dani, Rodrigo, Anarosa, Claudio, Viviane).

To my “French” friends, Alessandro, Yasmine, Hackim, Nicholas, Laurant, Caroline, Amal, Zahia, Frederic, Inês, Denise, Fred, Delfim, Manoel, Livia, André, Tâmara, Washington, Rodrigo, Jú, Amilcar and Rita.

To Ricardo, for making Paris the most romantic city in the world and for all the special moments spent together in the solitude of an internship.

To Natal Luiz, for giving me the opportunity to write this thesis looking at the Copacabana beach. This made all the difference!

To professor Ricardo Choren and to the many anonymous reviewers of my papers, for all comments, corrections and suggestions received.

To professors Vera, Evandro, Simone and Firmo for participating in the examination commission of this thesis. To all professors and employees of the Department for all the help received (specially to Alex, Ruth and Rosane).

To CNPq, CAPES and the “Departamento de Informática” of PUC-Rio, for the financial support; without which this work could not have been conducted.

## **Abstract**

Felicíssimo, Carolina Howard; Lucena, Carlos José Pereira de; Briot, Jean-Pierre. **An Approach to Operationalize Regulative Norms in Multiagent Systems.** Rio de Janeiro, 2008. 170p. Doctoral Thesis – Computer Science Department, Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro.

A major challenge in the research of multiagent systems (MAS) is the design and implementation of open MAS in which norms can be effectively applied to their agents and easily managed. These tasks are arduous because norms are usually written for general purposes, hindering a more precise regulation. The motivation for this research came forth from the need to resolve this challenge, providing an approach applicable in open systems. In such systems, heterogeneity and autonomy rule out any assumption concerning the way third-party entities are implemented and behaved. A viable solution for regulation in open MAS should not be hard coded inside agents' original implementations and must allow, for some degree of precision and flexibility, to update data (*e.g.*, norms) during the system execution. In this thesis, our DynaCROM approach for dealing with norms in open MAS is presented. From the individual agents' perspective, DynaCROM is an information mechanism that makes application agents aware of the norms they are bound to at a given moment. From the system developers' perspective, DynaCROM is a methodology for the application and management of norms in open MAS so developers are able to embody abstract norms with domain values. Therefore, norms are contextualized in the application domain wherein they hold, facilitating regulation. Considering that a regulated MAS should have its norms enforced, the integration of DynaCROM with two distinct enforcement mechanisms is also presented. In summary, the result of this thesis is our DynaCROM approach, which operationalizes regulative norms in MAS.

## **Keywords**

Regulative norms, contextual classification, regulatory compliance.

## Resumo

Felicíssimo, Carolina Howard; Lucena, Carlos José Pereira de; Briot, Jean-Pierre. **Uma Abordagem para Operacionalizar Normas Regulativas em Sistemas Multiagentes.** Rio de Janeiro, 2008. 170p. Tese de Doutorado – Departamento de Informática, Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio de Janeiro.

Um grande desafio na pesquisa de sistemas multiagentes (SMA) é a concepção e implementação de SMA abertos em que normas podem ser eficazmente aplicadas aos seus agentes e facilmente gerenciadas. Estas tarefas são árduas porque normas são usualmente escritas para propósitos gerais, dificultando uma regulação mais precisa. A motivação para esta pesquisa surgiu diante da necessidade de resolver este desafio, proporcionando uma abordagem aplicável em sistemas abertos. Nesses sistemas, heterogeneidade e autonomia excluem qualquer hipótese relativa à forma com que entidades de terceiros são implementadas e como se comportam. Assim, uma solução viável para regulação em SMA abertos não deve ser rigidamente codificada dentro das implementações originais de agentes e deve permitir, a um certo grau de precisão e flexibilidade, atualizar dados (e.g., normas) durante a execução do sistema. Nesta tese, nossa abordagem DynaCROM para lidar com normas em SMA abertos é apresentada. Da perspectiva individual de agentes, DynaCROM é um mecanismo informativo que torna agentes da aplicação cientes das normas as quais eles estão vinculados em um determinado momento. Da perspectiva de desenvolvedores do sistema, DynaCROM é uma metodologia para aplicação e gerenciamento de normas em SMA abertos de tal modo que desenvolvedores sejam capazes de incorporar em normas abstratas valores de domínio. Portanto, normas são contextualizadas no domínio de aplicação onde elas são válidas, facilitando regulação. Considerando que um SMA regulado deve ter suas normas respeitadas, apresentamos também a integração de DynaCROM com dois mecanismos distintos de cumprimento de normas. Em resumo, o resultado dessa tese é nossa abordagem DynaCROM que operacionaliza normas regulativas em SMA.

## Palavras-chave

Normas regulativas, classificação contextual, conformidade regulatória.

## Table of Contents

<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>1.1. Motivation</b>	<b>19</b>
1.1.1. Agents and Multiagent Systems	20
1.1.2. Open Multiagent Systems	21
1.1.3. Normative Multiagent Systems	23
<b>1.2. Research Approach</b>	<b>25</b>
1.2.1. Research Questions	25
1.2.2. Research Objectives	26
1.2.3. Research Scope	27
1.2.4. Research Methodology	28
<b>1.3. Usage Scenarios</b>	<b>30</b>
1.3.1. Market Based Control	30
1.3.2. TV Broadcasting	31
<b>1.4. Thesis Structure</b>	<b>32</b>
<b>2 Background and Related Research</b>	<b>34</b>
<b>2.1. Engineering of Multiagent Systems</b>	<b>34</b>
2.1.1. Modeling of Multiagent Systems	35
2.1.1.1. Electronic Agent-Based Organizations	36
2.1.1.2. Electronic Agent-Based Institutions	39
2.1.1.3. Discussion	42
2.1.1.4. Comparative Study	44
2.1.2. Implementation of Multiagent Systems	44
2.1.2.1. The JADE Agent Platform in Brief	45
2.1.2.2. The Agent Society Framework in Brief	46
2.1.2.3. Discussion	47
2.1.2.4. Comparative Study	48

<b>2.2. Norm Enforcement</b>	<b>48</b>
2.2.1. The Moses Mechanism for Implementing LGI Specifications	49
2.2.1.1. Discussion	51
2.2.2. The AMELI Middleware for Implementing ISLANDER Specifications	53
2.2.3. The $\mathcal{S}$ -MOISE <sup>+</sup> Middleware for Implementing MOISE <sup>+</sup> Specifications	54
2.2.4. SCAAR	55
2.2.5. The M-Law Middleware for Implementing XMLLaw Specifications	55
2.2.6. Discussion	56
2.2.7. Comparative Study	57
<b>2.3. Discussion</b>	<b>58</b>
<hr/> <b>3 Dynamic Contextual Regulation Information Provision</b>	<b>59</b>
<b>3.1. The DynaCROM Methodology for System Developers</b>	<b>59</b>
3.1.1. From Abstract to Concrete Norms in NMAS	59
3.1.2. Contextual Norm Classification	62
3.1.3. Contextual Norm Representation	65
3.1.3.1. Norm Representation by Using OWL	66
3.1.3.2. Declarative Specifications of Concrete Norms	67
3.1.4. Contextual Norm Composition	70
<b>3.2. The DynaCROM Information Mechanism for Application Agents</b>	<b>74</b>
3.2.1. DynaCROM Incorporation in Third-Party Agents	74
3.2.2. Openness in a DynaCROM NMAS	75
<b>3.3. Discussion</b>	<b>77</b>
<hr/> <b>4 Contextual Norm Enforcement</b>	<b>79</b>
<b>4.1. A Posteriori Norm Enforcement</b>	<b>79</b>
<b>4.2. A Priori Norm Enforcement</b>	<b>82</b>
<b>4.3. DynaCROM as an Input Mechanism for Norm Enforcement Solutions</b>	<b>83</b>
<b>4.4. Norm Enforcement Based on the Agents' External Behavior</b>	<b>84</b>
4.4.1. DynaCROM as an Input Mechanism for MOSES	85
<b>4.5. Norm Enforcement Based on the Agents' Internal Behavior</b>	<b>90</b>
4.5.1. DynaCROM as an Input Mechanism for SCAAR	90
<b>4.6. Discussion</b>	<b>94</b>

<b>5 Applications of DynaCROM</b>	<b>96</b>
<b>5.1. Introduction</b>	<b>96</b>
<b>5.2. The CAT Tournament</b>	<b>96</b>
5.2.1. DynaCROM at Work	96
5.2.2. DynaCROM_SCAAR at Work	106
5.2.3. DynaCROM_MOSES at Work	108
<b>5.3. TV Broadcasting</b>	<b>109</b>
5.3.1. DynaCROM at Work	110
5.3.2. DynaCROM_SCAAR at Work	115
5.3.3. DynaCROM_MOSES at Work	118
<b>5.4. Discussion</b>	<b>120</b>
<b>6 Comparison with Related Work</b>	<b>122</b>
<b>6.1. OMNI</b>	<b>122</b>
6.1.1. DynaCROM_OMNI at Work	125
<b>6.2. ISLANDER and AMELI</b>	<b>131</b>
<b>6.3. MOISE<sup>+</sup> and S-MOISE<sup>+</sup></b>	<b>136</b>
<b>6.4. XMLaw and M-Law</b>	<b>140</b>
<b>6.5. Discussion</b>	<b>141</b>
<b>7 Dynamic Contextual Protocol Information Provision</b>	<b>143</b>
<b>7.1. DynaCIP</b>	<b>143</b>
<b>7.2. DynaCIP at Work</b>	<b>144</b>
<b>8 Conclusion</b>	<b>149</b>
<b>8.1. Thesis Contributions</b>	<b>150</b>
<b>8.2. Future Work</b>	<b>151</b>
<b>References</b>	<b>154</b>

---

**Appendix A: List of the Thesis Publications** **165**

<b>Book Chapters</b>	<b>165</b>
<b>Conferences</b>	<b>166</b>
<b>Workshops</b>	<b>166</b>
<b>Short Papers</b>	<b>167</b>

---

**Appendix B: Source Code of a DynaCROM Specification** **168**

<b>Appendix B.1. Part of the a DynaCROM Ontology File</b>	<b>168</b>
<b>Appendix B.2. Part of a DynaCROM Rule File</b>	<b>170</b>

## Figure List

Figure 1 – The cycle followed as the research methodology of this thesis	29
Figure 2 – Agents from a same community operating under a unique law	52
Figure 3 – Activities, Regulated Activities and Contextual Regulated Activities, based on [Gaertner <i>et al.</i> , 2007]	60
Figure 4 – Contextual classifications for a payment norm	61
Figure 5 – Norms from different contextual normative levels	64
Figure 6 – The DynaCROM ontology	68
Figure 7 – An abstract payment norm concretized in <i>Japan</i> and <i>USA</i>	69
Figure 8 – A political norm concretized in <i>American</i> organizations	70
Figure 9 – The <i>Missouri</i> and <i>USA</i> hierarchical environments	71
Figure 10 – The DynaCROM composition process	73
Figure 11 – An urban traffic's scenario	80
Figure 12 – A situation in which contextual norms must be considered	81
Figure 13 – A <i>Hinduism</i> religious norm concretized in the <i>India</i> environment	82
Figure 14 – DynaCROM providing precise norm information as input to enforcers	83
Figure 15 – An example of a police agent enforcing norms for payments	85
Figure 16 – Receiving and adding the information about the national currency expected by the manufacturer agent	87
Figure 17 – Enforcement of a norm for payments with national currency	88
Figure 18 – Self-regulated agents enforcing norms for payments	90
Figure 19 – A Petri net created to represent a payment norm in <i>American</i> environments	94
Figure 20 – Concrete environment norms for calculating prices	99
Figure 21 – Basus and IMD concrete norms	101
Figure 22 – Concrete organization norms for providing warranty	102
Figure 23 – A concrete economical norm for making price fixing	104
Figure 24 – Holidays in <i>American</i> environments	106
Figure 25 – Enforcement of a political norm by DynaCROM_MOSES	108
Figure 26 – A conceptual model for a NMAS from the television domain	111
Figure 27 – An instance part of the conceptual model created for a DynaCROM NMAS from the television domain	113
Figure 28 – Enforcement of the norm to screen a foreign TV program	119

Figure 29 – Levels and dimensions of the OMNI framework, from [Vàzquez-Salceda <i>et al.</i> , 2005]	123
Figure 30 – Levels and dimensions of DynaCROM, based on Figure 29	123
Figure 31 – Representation in DynaCROM of a OMNI role description	126
Figure 32 – DynaCROM_MOSES enforcing the paper deadline norm	127
Figure 33 –DynaCROM_SCAAR enforcing the paper deadline norm	129
Figure 34 – Representation in DynaCROM of a OMNI group description	130
Figure 35 – Structure of a soccer team, from [Hübner <i>et al.</i> , 2002]	137
Figure 36 – A social scheme to score a soccer goal	137
Figure 37 – Levels and dimensions of MOSES <sup>+</sup>	138
Figure 38 – Levels and dimensions of DynaCROM compared to MOSES <sup>+</sup>	138
Figure 39 – The DynaCIP ontology	144
Figure 40 – Concrete environment protocols for communicating	145
Figure 41 – Concrete contextual protocols of PUC-Rio	147

## Table List

Table 1. A comparative study conducted among modeling solutions for MAS engineering .....	44
Table 2. A comparative study conducted between implementation solutions for MAS engineering.....	48
Table 3. A comparative study conducted among norm enforcement solutions ...	58
Table 4. Results of DynaCROM combined with third-party norm enforcers.....	95
Table 5. Computer components' information.....	97
Table 6. Multinational supplier organizations .....	97
Table 7. TV broadcasters of the <i>ABC</i> and <i>Nine Australian TV Corporations</i> ....	112
Table 8. PC member role description in OMNI, from [Vàzquez-Salceda <i>et al.</i> , 2005].....	126
Table 9. Description of the organizer group in OMNI, from [Vàzquez-Salceda <i>et al.</i> , 2005] .....	130
Table 10. Possible requests from an agent to its governor, from [Esteva <i>et al.</i> , 2004].....	134
Table 11. Results of DynaCROM as a modeling solution for MAS engineering	142

## Code List

Code 1. A DynaCROM rule to compose the norms of hierarchical environments .....	72
Code 2. DynaCROM rules to compose the norms of normative contexts .....	72
Code 3. A rule for composing the norms of two indirectly related concepts.....	73
Code 4. Adding DynaCROM in a third-party JADE agent.....	75
Code 5. A method to be implemented by seller agents .....	76
Code 6. Adding the national currency of a country in its states .....	77
Code 7. An overview of the MOSES methods and predicative.....	86
Code 8. Part of a MOSES law for informing an expected variable value .....	87
Code 9. Part of a MOSES law for enforcing payment norms.....	88
Code 10. A SCAAR norm written to regulate manufacturers when they pay a placed order.....	92
Code 11. A SCAAR norm written to regulate manufacturers when they calculate prices .....	92
Code 12. SCAAR pseudo algorithm for norm enforcement .....	93
Code 13. A DynaCROM rule for applying an economical norm in Chinese organizations.....	104
Code 14. A rule for applying federal holidays in environments .....	106
Code 15. Part of a method to be implemented by manufacturer agents .....	107
Code 16. A purchase's order to a supplier .....	107
Code 17. Enforcing a political norm in the example .....	107
Code 18. An ACCEPT_PROPOSAL message sent to a supplier agent .....	108
Code 19. Part of a MOSES law for enforcing the political norm .....	109
Code 20. Applying the censorship norm in broadcasters .....	113
Code 21. Applying corporation norms in their broadcasters .....	115
Code 22. Part of a method to be implemented by broadcaster agents .....	115
Code 23. Enforcing the obligation norm to present TV content rating information .....	116
Code 24. Part of a SCAAR norm concretized by DynaCROM.....	117
Code 25. Applying TV content rating systems in TV broadcasters .....	117
Code 26. Enforcing the obligation norm to present subtitles.....	118
Code 27. Adding the information about the national language expected by broadcasters .....	118

Code 28. An INFORM message sent by a broadcaster agent.....	119
Code 29. Part of a MOSES law for enforcing the norm to screen a foreign TV program .....	120
Code 30. Part of a method to be implemented by <i>PC_member</i> agents.....	127
Code 31. Part of a MOSES law for enforcing the paper deadline norm.....	128
Code 32. Part of a SCAAR code for enforcing the paper deadline norm .....	129
Code 33. Adding the norms of a group in its roles.....	131
Code 34. DynaCIP rules to compose contextual protocols.....	147
Code 35. The OWL-DL source code created for representing a DynaCROM religious norm .....	169
Code 36. The JENA source code created for composing religious norms with environments norms.....	170

## Glossary

ACL	Agent Communication Language
ASF	Agent Society Framework
COIN	Coordination, Organization, Institutions and Norms
CORBA	Common Object Request Broker Architecture
DTV	Digital Television
EI	Electronic Institutions
FIPA	Foundation for Intelligent Physical Agents
GIOP	General Inter-ORB Protocol
IIOP	Internet Inter-Orb Protocol
JADE	JAVA Agent Development Environment
KQML	Knowledge Query and Manipulation Language
MAS	Multiagent System(s)
NMAS	Normative Multiagent System(s)
OWL	Web Ontology Language
OWL-DL	Web Ontology Language - Description Logic
RMI	Remote Method Invocation
TADA	Trading Agent Design and Analysis
TAC	Trading Agent Competition
TCP/IP	Transmission Control Protocol/Internet Protocol
URL	Uniform Resource Locator
W3C	World Web Consortium